

HANDBOOK OF MULTISENSOR DATA FUSION

Edited by
DAVID L. HALL, PH.D.
JAMES LLINAS, PH.D.



CRC Press

Boca Raton London New York Washington, D.C.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Hall, David L.

Handbook of multisensor data fusion / David L. Hall and James Llinas.

p. cm. -- (Electrical engineering and applied signal processing)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-8493-2379-7 (alk. paper)

1. Multisensor data fusion--Handbooks, manuals, etc. I. Llinas, James. II. Title. III.

Series.

TK5102.9 .H355 2001

681'.2--dc21

2001025085

This book contains information obtained from authentic and highly regarded sources. Reprinted material is quoted with permission, and sources are indicated. A wide variety of references are listed. Reasonable efforts have been made to publish reliable data and information, but the author and the publisher cannot assume responsibility for the validity of all materials or for the consequences of their use.

Neither this book nor any part may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, microfilming, and recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher.

All rights reserved. Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use, or the personal or internal use of specific clients, may be granted by CRC Press LLC, provided that \$1.50 per page photocopied is paid directly to Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA. The fee code for users of the Transactional Reporting Service is ISBN 0-8493-2379-7/01/\$0.00+\$1.50. The fee is subject to change without notice. For organizations that have been granted a photocopy license by the CCC, a separate system of payment has been arranged.

The consent of CRC Press LLC does not extend to copying for general distribution, for promotion, for creating new works, or for resale. Specific permission must be obtained in writing from CRC Press LLC for such copying.

Direct all inquiries to CRC Press LLC, 2000 N.W. Corporate Blvd., Boca Raton, Florida 33431.

Trademark Notice: Product or corporate names may be trademarks or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and explanation, without intent to infringe.

Visit the CRC Press Web site at www.crcpress.com

© 2001 by CRC Press LLC

International Standard Book Number 0-8493-2379-7

Library of Congress Card Number 2001025085

Printed in the United States of America 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 0

Printed on acid-free paper

PREFACE

Multisensor data fusion is an emerging technology applied to Department of Defense (DoD) areas such as automated target recognition (ATR), identification–friend–foe–neutral (IFFN) recognition systems, battle-field surveillance, and guidance and control of autonomous vehicles. Non-DoD applications include monitoring of complex machinery, environmental surveillance and monitoring systems, medical diagnosis, and smart buildings. Techniques for data fusion are drawn from a wide variety of disciplines, including signal processing, pattern recognition, statistical estimation, artificial intelligence, and control theory. The rapid evolution of computers, proliferation of micro-mechanical/electrical systems (MEMS) sensors, and the maturation of data fusion technology provide a basis for utilization of data fusion in everyday applications.

This book is intended to be a comprehensive resource for data fusion system designers and researchers, providing information on terminology, models, algorithms, systems engineering issues, and examples of applications. The book is divided into four main parts. Part I introduces data fusion terminology and models. Chapter 1 provides a general introduction to data fusion and terminology. Chapter 2 introduces the Joint Directors of Laboratories (JDL) data fusion process model, widely used to assist in understanding DoD applications. In Chapter 3, Jeffrey Uhlmann discusses the problem of multitarget, multisensor tracking and introduces the challenges of data association and correlation. Chapter 4, by Ed Waltz, introduces concepts of image and spatial data fusion, and in Chapter 5 Richard Brooks and Lynne Grewe describe issues of data registration for image fusion. Chapter 6, written by Richard Antony, discusses issues of data fusion focused on situation assessment and database management. Finally, in Chapter 7, Joseph Carl contrasts some approaches to combining evidence using probability and fuzzy set theory.

A perennial problem in multisensor fusion involves combining data from multiple sensors to track moving targets. Gauss originally addressed this problem for estimating the orbits of asteroids by developing the method of least squares. In its most general form, this problem is not tractable. In general, we do not know *a priori* how many targets exist or how to assign observations to potential targets. Hence, we must simultaneously estimate the state (e.g., position and velocity) of N targets based on M sensor reports and also determine which of the M reports belong to (or should be assigned to) each of the N targets. This problem may be complicated by closely spaced, maneuvering targets with potential observational clutter and false alarms.

Part II of this book presents alternative views of this multisensor, multitarget tracking problem. In Chapter 8, T. Kirubarajan and Yaakov Bar-Shalom present an overview of their approach for probabilistic data association (PDA) and the joint PDA (JPDA) methods. These have been useful in dense target tracking environments. In Chapter 9, Jeffrey Uhlmann describes another approach using an approximate method for addressing the data association combination problem. A classical Bayesian approach to target tracking and identification is described by Lawrence D. Stone in Chapter 10. This has been applied to problems in target identification and tracking for undersea vehicles. Recent research by Aubrey B. Poore, Suihua Lu, and Brian J. Suchomel is summarized in Chapter 11. Poore's approach combines the problem of estimation and data association by generalizing the optimization problem, followed by development of efficient computational methods. In Chapter 12, Simon Julier and Jeffrey K. Uhlmann discuss issues

related to the estimation of target error and how to treat the codependence between sensors. They extend this work to nonlinear systems in Chapter 13. Finally, in Chapter 14, Ronald Mahler provides a very extensive discussion of multitarget, multisensor tracking using an approach based on random set theory.

Part III of this book addresses issues of the design and development of data fusion systems. It begins with Chapter 15 by Ed Waltz and David L. Hall, and describes a systemic approach for deriving data fusion system requirements. Chapter 16 by Christopher Bowman and Alan Steinberg provides a general discussion of the systems engineering process for data fusion systems including the selection of appropriate architectures. In Chapter 17, David L. Hall, James Llinas, Christopher L. Bowman, Lori McConnel, and Paul Applegate provide engineering guidelines for the selection of data fusion algorithms. In Chapter 18, Richard Antony presents a discussion of database management support, with applications to tactical data fusion. New concepts for designing human-computer interfaces (HCI) for data fusion systems are summarized in Chapter 19 by Mary Jane Hall, Sonya Hall, and Timothy Tate. Performance assessment issues are described by James Llinas in Chapter 20. Finally, in Chapter 21, David L. Hall and Alan N. Steinberg present the *dirty secrets* of data fusion. The experience of implementing data fusion systems described in this section was primarily gained on DoD applications; however, the lessons learned should be of value to system designers for any application.

Part IV of this book provides a taste of the breadth of applications to which data fusion technology can be applied. Mary L. Nichols, in Chapter 22, presents a limited survey of some DoD fusion systems. In Chapter 23, Carl S. Byington and Amulya K. Garga describe the use of data fusion to improve the ability to monitor complex mechanical systems. Robert J. Hansen, Daniel Cooke, Kenneth Ford, and Steven Zornetzer provide an overview of data fusion applications at the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) in Chapter 24. In Chapter 25, Richard R. Brooks describes an application of data fusion funded by DARPA. Finally, in Chapter 26, Hans Keithley describes how to determine the utility of data fusion for C4ISR. This fourth part of the book is not by any means intended to be a comprehensive survey of data fusion applications. Instead, it is included to provide the reader with a sense of different types of applications. Finally, Part V of this book provides a list of Internet Web sites and news groups related to multisensor data fusion.

The editors hope that this handbook will be a valuable addition to the bookshelves of data fusion researchers and system designers. We remind the reader that data fusion remains an evolving discipline. Even for classic problems, such as multisensor, multitarget tracking, competing approaches exist. The book has sought to identify and provide a representation of the leading methods in data fusion. The reader should be advised, however, that there are disagreements in the data fusion community (especially by some of the contributors to this book) concerning which method is *best*. It is interesting to read the descriptions that the authors in this book present concerning the relationship between their own techniques and those of the other authors. Many of this book's contributors have written recent texts that advocate a particular method. These authors have condensed or summarized that information as a chapter here.

We take the view that each competing method must be considered in the context of a specific application. We believe that there is no such thing as a generic data fusion system. Instead, there are numerous applications to which data fusion techniques can be applied. In our view, there is no such thing as a magic approach or technique. Even very sophisticated algorithms may be corrupted by a lack of *a priori* information or incorrect information concerning sensor performance. Thus, we advise the reader to become a knowledgeable and demanding consumer of fusion algorithms.

We hope that this text will become a companion to other texts on data fusion methods and techniques, and that it assists the data fusion community in its continuing maturation process.

Acknowledgment

The editors acknowledge the support and dedication of Ms. Natalie Nodianos, who performed extensive work to coordinate with the contributing authors. In addition, she assisted the contributing authors in clarifying and improving their manuscripts. Her attention to detail and her insights have greatly assisted in developing this handbook. In addition, the editors acknowledge the extensive work done by Mary Jane Hall. She provided support in editing, developed many graphics, and assisted in coordinating the final review process. She also provided continuous encouragement and moral support throughout this project. Finally, the editors would like to express their appreciation for the assistance provided by Barbara L. Davies.

Editors

David L. Hall, Ph.D., is the associate dean of research and graduate studies for The Pennsylvania State University School of Information Sciences and Technology. He has conducted research in data fusion and related technical areas for more than 20 years and has lectured internationally on data fusion and artificial intelligence. In addition, he has participated in the implementation of real-time data fusion systems for several military applications. He is the author of three textbooks (including *Mathematical Techniques in Multisensor Data Fusion*, published by Artech House, 1992) and more than 180 technical papers. Prior to joining the Pennsylvania State University, Dr. Hall worked at HRB Systems (a division of Raytheon, E-Systems), at the Computer Sciences Corporation, and at the MIT Lincoln Laboratory. He is a senior member of the IEEE. Dr. Hall earned a master's and doctorate degrees in astrophysics and an undergraduate degree in physics and mathematics.

James Llinas, Ph.D., is an adjunct research professor at the State University of New York at Buffalo. An expert in data fusion, he coauthored the first integrated book on the subject (*Multisensor Data Fusion*, published by Artech House, 1990) and has lectured internationally on the subject for over 15 years. For the past decade, he has been a technical advisor to the Defense Department's Joint Directors of Laboratories Data Fusion Panel. His experience in applying data fusion technology to different problem areas ranges from complex defense and intelligence-system applications to nondefense diagnosis. His current projects include basic and applied research in automated reasoning, distributed, cooperative problem solving, avionics information fusion architectures, and the scientific foundations of data correlation. He earned a doctorate degree in industrial engineering.

Contributors

Richard Antony

VGS Inc.
Fairfax, Virginia

Paul Applegate

Consultant
Buffalo, New York

Yaakov Bar-Shalom

University of Connecticut
Storrs, Connecticut

Christopher L. Bowman

Consultant
Broomfield, Colorado

Richard R. Brooks

The Pennsylvania State University
University Park, Pennsylvania

Carl S. Byington

The Pennsylvania State University
University Park, Pennsylvania

Joseph W. Carl

Harris Corporation
Annapolis, Maryland

Daniel Cooke

NASA Ames Research Center
Moffett Field, California

Kenneth Ford

Institute for Human and Machine
Cognition
Pensacola, Florida

Amulya K. Garga

The Pennsylvania State University
University Park, Pennsylvania

Lynne Grewe

California State University
Hayward, California

David L. Hall

The Pennsylvania State University
University Park, Pennsylvania

Mary Jane M. Hall

TECH REACH Inc.
State College, Pennsylvania

Capt. Sonya A. Hall

Minot AFB
Minot, North Dakota

Robert J. Hansen

University of West Florida
Pensacola, Florida

Simon Julier

IDAK Industries
Jefferson City, Missouri

Hans Keithley

Office of the Secretary of Defense
Decision Support Center
Arlington, Virginia

T. Kirubarajan

University of Connecticut
Storrs, Connecticut

James Llinas

State University of New York
Buffalo, New York

Suihua Lu

Colorado State University
Fort Collins, Colorado

Ronald Mahler

Lockheed Martin
Eagan, Minnesota

Capt. Lori McConnell

USAF/Space Warfare Center
Denver, Colorado

Mary L. Nichols

The Aerospace Corporation
El Segundo, California

Aubrey B. Poore

Colorado State University
Fort Collins, Colorado

Alan N. Steinberg

Utah State University
Logan, Utah

Lawrence D. Stone

Metron, Inc.
Reston, Virginia

Brian J. Suchomel

Numerica, Inc.
Fort Collins, Colorado

Timothy Tate

Naval Training Command
Arlington, Virginia

Jeffrey K. Uhlmann

University of Missouri
Columbia, Missouri

Ed Waltz

Veridian Systems
Ann Arbor, Michigan

Steven Zornetzer

NASA Ames Research Center
Moffett Field, California

Contents

Part I Introduction to Multisensor Data Fusion

- 1 Multisensor Data Fusion *David L. Hall and James Llinas*
 - 1.1 Introduction
 - 1.2 Multisensor Advantages
 - 1.3 Military Applications
 - 1.4 Nonmilitary Applications
 - 1.5 Three Processing Architectures
 - 1.6 A Data Fusion Process Model
 - 1.7 Assessment of the State of the Art
 - 1.8 Additional InformationReference

- 2 Revisions to the JDL Data Fusion Model *Alan N. Steinberg and Christopher L. Bowman*
 - 2.1 Introduction
 - 2.2 What Is Data Fusion? What Isn't?
 - 2.3 Models and Architectures
 - 2.4 Beyond the Physical
 - 2.5 Comparison with Other Models
 - 2.6 SummaryReferences

- 3 Introduction to the Algorithmics of Data Association in Multiple-Target Tracking *Jeffrey K. Uhlmann*
 - 3.1 Introduction
 - 3.2 Ternary Trees
 - 3.3 Priority *kd*-Trees
 - 3.4 ConclusionAcknowledgments
References

- 4 The Principles and Practice of Image and Spatial Data Fusion
Ed Waltz
- 4.1 Introduction
 - 4.2 Motivations for Combining Image and Spatial Data
 - 4.3 Defining Image and Spatial Data Fusion
 - 4.4 Three Classic Levels of Combination for Multisensor Automatic Target Recognition
Data Fusion
 - 4.5 Image Data Fusion for Enhancement of Imagery Data
 - 4.6 Spatial Data Fusion Applications
 - 4.7 Summary
- References
- 5 Data Registration *Richard R. Brooks and Lynne Grewe*
- 5.1 Introduction
 - 5.2 Registration Problem
 - 5.3 Review of Existing Research
 - 5.4 Registration Using Meta-Heuristics
 - 5.5 Wavelet-Based Registration of Range Images
 - 5.6 Registration Assistance/Preprocessing
 - 5.7 Conclusion
- Acknowledgments
References
- 6 Data Fusion Automation: A Top-Down Perspective *Richard Antony*
- 6.1 Introduction
 - 6.2 Biologically Motivated Fusion Process Model
 - 6.3 Fusion Process Model Extensions
 - 6.4 Observations
- Acknowledgments
References
- 7 Contrasting Approaches to Combine Evidence *Joseph W. Carl*
- 7.1 Introduction
 - 7.2 Alternative Approaches to Combine Evidence
 - 7.3 An Example Data Fusion System
 - 7.4 Contrasts and Conclusion
- Appendix 7.A The Axiomatic Definition of Probability
References

Part II Advanced Tracking and Association Methods

- 8 Target Tracking Using Probabilistic Data Association-Based Techniques with Applications to Sonar, Radar, and EO Sensors *T. Kirubarajan and Yaakov Bar-Shalom*
 - 8.1 Introduction
 - 8.2 Probabilistic Data Association
 - 8.3 Low Observable TMA Using the ML-PDA Approach with Features
 - 8.4 The IMM-PDAF for Tracking Maneuvering Targets
 - 8.5 A Flexible-Window ML-PDA Estimator for Tracking Low Observable (LO) Targets
 - 8.6 SummaryReferences

- 9 An Introduction to the Combinatorics of Optimal and Approximate Data Association *Jeffrey K. Uhlmann*
 - 9.1 Introduction
 - 9.2 Background
 - 9.3 Most Probable Assignments
 - 9.4 Optimal Approach
 - 9.5 Computational Considerations
 - 9.6 Efficient Computation of the JAM
 - 9.7 Crude Permanent Approximations.
 - 9.8 Approximations Based on Permanent Inequalities
 - 9.9 Comparisons of Different Approaches
 - 9.10 Large-Scale Data Associations
 - 9.11 Generalizations
 - 9.12 ConclusionsAcknowledgments
Appendix 9.A Algorithm for Data Association Experiment
References

- 10 A Bayesian Approach to Multiple-Target Tracking *Lawrence D. Stone*
 - 10.1 Introduction
 - 10.2 Bayesian Formulation of the Single-Target Tracking Problem
 - 10.3 Multiple-Target Tracking without Contacts or Association (Unified Tracking)
 - 10.4 Multiple-Hypothesis Tracking (MHT)
 - 10.5 Relationship of Unified Tracking to MHT and Other Tracking Approaches
 - 10.6 Likelihood Ratio Detection and TrackingReferences

- 11** Data Association Using Multiple Frame Assignments *Aubrey B. Poore, Suihua Lu, and Brian J. Suchomel*
- 11.1 Introduction
 - 11.2 Problem Background
 - 11.3 Assignment Formulation of Some General Data Association Problems
 - 11.4 Multiple Frame Track Initiation and Track Maintenance
 - 11.5 Algorithms
 - 11.6 Future Directions
- Acknowledgments
References
- 12** General Decentralized Data Fusion with Covariance Intersection (CI) *Simon Julier and Jeffrey K. Uhlmann*
- 12.1 Introduction
 - 12.2 Decentralized Data Fusion
 - 12.3 Covariance Intersection
 - 12.4 Using Covariance Intersection for Distributed Data Fusion
 - 12.5 Extended Example
 - 12.6 Incorporating Known Independent Information
 - 12.7 Conclusions
- Appendix 12.A The Consistency of CI
Appendix 12.B MATLAB Source Code (Conventional CI and Split CI)
Acknowledgments
References
- 13** Data Fusion in Nonlinear Systems *Simon Julier and Jeffrey K. Uhlmann*
- 13.1 Introduction
 - 13.2 Estimation in Nonlinear Systems
 - 13.3 The Unscented Transformation (UT)
 - 13.4 Uses of the Transformation
 - 13.5 The Unscented Filter (UF)
 - 13.6 Case Study: Using the UF with Linearization Errors
 - 13.7 Case Study: Using the UF with a High-Order Nonlinear System
 - 13.8 Multilevel Sensor Fusion
 - 13.9 Conclusions
- Acknowledgments
References
- 14** Random Set Theory for Target Tracking and Identification *Ronald Mahler*
- 14.1 Introduction
 - 14.2 Basic Statistics for Tracking and Identification
 - 14.3 Multitarget Sensor Models

- 14.4 Multitarget Motion Models
- 14.5 The FISST Multisource-Multitarget Calculus
- 14.6 FISST Multisource-Multitarget Statistics
- 14.7 Optimal-Bayes Fusion, Tracking, ID
- 14.8 Robust-Bayes Fusion, Tracking, ID
- 14.9 Summary and Conclusions
- Acknowledgments
- References

Part III Systems Engineering and Implementation

- 15 Requirements Derivation for Data Fusion Systems *Ed Waltz and David L. Hall*
 - 15.1 Introduction
 - 15.2 Requirements Analysis Process
 - 15.3 Engineering Flow-Down Approach
 - 15.4 Enterprise Architecture Approach
 - 15.5 Comparison of Approaches
 - References

- 16 A Systems Engineering Approach for Implementing Data Fusion Systems *Christopher L. Bowman and Alan N. Steinberg*
 - 16.1 Scope
 - 16.2 Architecture for Data Fusion
 - 16.3 Data Fusion System Engineering Process
 - 16.4 Fusion System Role Optimization.
 - References

- 17 Studies and Analyses with Project Correlation: An In-Depth Assessment of Correlation Problems and Solution Techniques *James Llinas, Lori McConnel, Christopher L. Bowman, David L. Hall, and Paul Applegate*
 - 17.1 Introduction
 - 17.2 A Description of the Data Correlation (DC) Problem
 - 17.3 Hypothesis Generation
 - 17.4 Hypothesis Evaluation
 - 17.5 Hypothesis Selection
 - 17.6 Summary
 - References

- 18 Data Management Support to Tactical Data Fusion *Richard Antony*
 - 18.1 Introduction
 - 18.2 Database Management Systems

- 18.3 Spatial, Temporal, and Hierarchical Reasoning
- 18.4 Database Design Criteria
- 18.5 Object Representation of Space
- 18.6 Integrated Spatial/Nonspatial Data Representation
- 18.7 Sample Application
- 18.8 Summary and Conclusions
- Acknowledgments
- References

19 Removing the HCI Bottleneck: How the Human-Computer Interface (HCI) Affects the Performance of Data Fusion Systems
Mary Jane M. Hall, Sonya A. Hall, and Timothy Tate

- 19.1 Introduction
- 19.2 A Multimedia Experiment
- 19.3 Summary of Results
- 19.4 Implications for Data Fusion Systems
- Acknowledgment
- References

20 Assessing the Performance of Multisensor Fusion Processes
James Llinas

- 20.1 Introduction
- 20.2 Test and Evaluation of the Data Fusion Process
- 20.3 Tools for Evaluation: Testbeds, Simulations, and Standard Data Sets
- 20.4 Relating Fusion Performance to Military Effectiveness — Measures of Merit
- 20.5 Summary
- References

21 Dirty Secrets in Multisensor Data Fusion *David L. Hall and Alan N. Steinberg*

- 21.1 Introduction
- 21.2 The JDL Data Fusion Process Model
- 21.3 Current Practices and Limitations in Data Fusion
- 21.4 Research Needs
- 21.5 Pitfalls in Data Fusion
- 21.6 Summary
- References

Part IV Sample Applications

22 A Survey of Multisensor Data Fusion Systems *Mary L. Nichols*

- 22.1 Introduction
- 22.2 Recent Survey of Data Fusion Activities
- 22.3 Assessment of System Capabilities

References

- 23** Data Fusion for Developing Predictive Diagnostics for Electromechanical Systems *Carl S. Byington and Amulya K. Garga*
- 23.1 Introduction
 - 23.2 Aspects of a CBM System
 - 23.3 The Diagnosis Problem
 - 23.4 Multisensor Fusion Toolkit
 - 23.5 Application Examples
 - 23.6 Concluding Remarks
- Acknowledgments
References
- 24** Information Technology for NASA in the 21st Century *Robert J. Hansen, Daniel Cooke, Kenneth Ford, and Steven Zornetzer*
- 24.1 Introduction
 - 24.2 NASA Applications
 - 24.3 Critical Research Investment Areas for NASA
 - 24.4 High-Performance Computing and Networking
 - 24.5 Conclusions
- 25** Data Fusion for a Distributed Ground-Based Sensing System *Richard R. Brooks*
- 25.1 Introduction
 - 25.2 Problem Domain
 - 25.3 Existing Systems
 - 25.4 Prototype Sensors for SenseIT
 - 25.5 Software Architecture
 - 25.6 Declarative Language Front-End
 - 25.7 Subscriptions
 - 25.8 Mobile Code
 - 25.9 Diffusion Network Routing
 - 25.10 Collaborative Signal Processing
 - 25.11 Information Security
 - 25.12 Summary
- Acknowledgments and Disclaimers
References
- 26** An Evaluation Methodology for Fusion Processes Based on Information Needs *Hans Keithley*
- 26.1 Introduction
 - 26.2 Information Needs
 - 26.3 Key Concept

26.4 Evaluation Methodology
References

Part V Resources

Web Sites and News Groups Related to Data Fusion

Data Fusion Web Sites

News Groups

Other World Wide Web Information

Government Laboratories and Agencies